

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

**Thursday, July 16, 2015
50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'**

Commissioners Present: Beth Clark, Tom Wolf, Steward Gibboney, Daniel Morgan, Charles Rowan (arrived 6:09),
Abbie Faust (arrived-6:14; excused-8:10),

Commissioners Absent:

Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Randy Black

- I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:05 p.m.
- II.** NEXT BUSINESS MEETING—THURSDAY, August 13, 2015.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING—THURSDAY, August 20, 2015.
- IV.** SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V.** APPROVAL OF Thursday, June 18, 2015, MEETING MINUTES.
MOTION: Clark/Wolf (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VI.** STAFF APPROVALS
The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Clark/Morgan (4-0-1) [Rowan]— ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD
- VII.** PUBLIC FORUM

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-7-11b

53 East Northwood Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

David Neiderhiser (Applicant/Owner)

15-7-11b

Following the H. P. O. staff report and presentation, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-7-11b, 53 E. Northwood Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications noted.

Install Skylights—Four (4) Total

- Install two (2) twenty-one inch by forty-five and one quarter inch (21" x 45 1/4"), low-profile skylights per side.
- All skylights to be at the rear of the main roof and not be visible from the front elevation.
- Applicant/Owner to submit skylight cut sheet with all dimensions indicated.
- Applicant/Owner to submit sketch indicating the exact locations of the skylights.
- **C. of A. #14-7-11b to be held on file pending final review and approval by the Historic Preservation Officer and Commissioner Morgan.**

MOTION: Rowan/Wolf (5-0-0) APPROVED

2. **15-7-6b**

667 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Application # 15-7-6b has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the July 9, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

3. **15-7-7b**

671 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Application # 15-7-6b has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the July 9, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

4. **15-7-13**

1646 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Vickie R. Ellison (Applicant/Owner)

Application # 15-7-13 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the July 19, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

5. **15-7-16**

130 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

John M. Jahn (Applicant/Owner)

Application # 15-7-16 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the July 19, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

CONCEPTUAL REVIEWS

6. **15-7-9b**

1516 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Classic Turnkey Properties, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant/Owner, continue Application #15-4-10, 296-98 Kelton Avenue, Bryden Road Historic District, and direct the H. P. O. staff to place on the June 18, 2015 meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Morgan/Wolf (5-0-1) [Gibboney] CONTINUED

7. **15-7-16**

170 East Oakland Avenue

Nick Lamatrice (Applicant/Owner)

Construct Parking Pad—(Rear Yard)

- Remove flower bed, fence, and one (1) tree from rear yard and prepare the site for the installation of a new concrete parking pad to accommodate four (4) off-street parking spaces.

Following the H. P. O. staff report and subsequent presentation seeking conceptual comments in consultation with the Applicant/Owner who had a scheduling conflict, the commissioners present noted the following:

All Commissioners: Voiced concern regarding rear yard tree removal in preparation for a new parking pad.

Requested additional information about rear yard fencing. Unanimous in allowing no more than two (2) parking spaces in the rear yard with appropriate, substantial screening of the pad with fence and/or landscaping elements that prevent vehicle entry onto the grass.

A new application is necessary for further conceptual or final review.

NO FORMAL ACTION TAKEN

HOLDOVERS

8. 15-6-14

100 Jefferson Avenue

Jefferson Avenue Historic District

The Jefferson Center for Learning & the Arts (Applicant/Owner)

Attn.: Katherine Moore, Executive Director

Following the H. P. O. staff report, the presentation by Doug Wilkins, property manager, and the review and discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-6-14, 100 Jefferson Avenue, Jefferson Avenue Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications and/or revisions noted.

Tuck Point Masonry—All Elevations

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used brick of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust for Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Masonry Cleaning—All Elevations

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings," <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm>).

Repair Windows—All Elevations

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes. Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows. Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like. Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension.

Paint Exterior Complete

- Finish coat all exposed wood surfaces on the building with exterior paint in accordance with manufacturer's specifications and industry standards.
- Finish paint schedule is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission prior to applying any topcoats.

Roofing

- Remove rear shed roof
- Remove & install new roofing complete—EPDM (Solarium) & Asphalt shingle (Main, Dormers, & Porches)

Install ADA Ramp

- Install new ADA entrance with ramp per submitted plans.

Install Matching Fence

- Install new wrought iron fence on north side of front yard. Style, dimensions, and color to match the existing fence; like-for-like.

MOTION: Clark/Wolf (5-0-1) [Morgan] APPROVED

9. 15-3-6b

693 S. Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Tom Lang (Applicant/Owner)

Table Application #15-3-6b, Old Oaks Historic District, at the request of the Applicant/Owner to allow additional time to prepare all finish details and direct the Historic Preservation Officer to place on a future Historic Resources Commission meeting agenda upon request by the Applicant/Owner.

MOTION: Wolf/Morgan (6-0-0) TABLED

10. 15-4-10

296-98 Kelton Avenue

Bryden Road Historic District

Kevin Abt (Applicant/Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant/Owner, continue Application #15-4-10, 296-98 Kelton Avenue, Bryden Road Historic District, and direct the H. P. O. staff to place on the August 20, 2015 meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Faust/Clark (5-0-1) [Gibboney] CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

11. 15-7-12

332 Chittenden Avenue

New Indianola Historic District

Gary Clark (Applicants/Owners)

Following the H. P. O. staff report, the presentation by the Owners/Applicants, and the review and discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-7-12, 332 Chittenden Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications and/or revisions noted.

Construct New Frame Garage

- Construct new, wood-frame garage per submitted drawings, section, and siding sample. It is recommended that the garage final dimensions be widened to twenty-two feet by twenty-four feet (22' x 24')
- New garage to have a two (2) nine foot wide (9' W) vehicle overhead doors with cut sheet to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Roof shingles with metal ridge roll to be selected from the Approved Shingles List specifications.
- New garage to have six inch (6") wooden lap siding per submitted sample with wood corner boards.
- **Any/all garage finish details including but not limited to: Wood Siding; Service and Overhead Doors; Exterior Light Fixtures; Roof Shingles; Window(s); Final Site Plan, etc. to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**
- **Service walk and wooden privacy fence details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**

MOTION: Faust/Rowan (6-0-0) APPROVED

12. 15-7-13

649 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Lori Wainwright (Applicant/Owner)

Following the H. P. O. staff report and subsequent presentation in consultation with the Applicant/Owner who had a scheduling conflict, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-7-113, 649 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications and/or revisions noted.

Demolish Garage

- Demolish existing deteriorated wood-frame garage and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- The Historic Resources Commission recommends that the Applicant/Owner salvage any/all building materials from the garage structure and make available for reuse as a part of the deconstruction process where possible.
- Provide current interior and exterior photos and measured drawing of the existing frame garage for placement in the property file for the permanent record prior to demolition.

Install Privacy Fence

- Install a new, six foot high (6'H), wood, board-on-board fence in rear yard so that vehicular access is not possible. Stringers to be on the inside only with finish boards to be facing the neighboring properties.
- Site plan indicating exact fence location to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

[NOTE: Project completion is intended to be sixty to ninety (60-90) days following commission approval.]

MOTION: Morgan/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

13. 15-7-8b & c

1438 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

M. Shane Hunt Member Integrity Trust Homes, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the H. P. O. staff report, the presentation by the Owners/Applicants, and the review and discussion with the commissioners present, Application #15-7-14 was separated into Items 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

15-7-14b

Approve Application #15-7-8b, 1438 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications and/or revisions noted.

Construct New Garage

- Build a new, twenty-two foot by twenty-four foot four inch (22' x 24' 4"), wood-frame, two-car garage in the rear yard per submitted plans.
- New garage to have a two (2) nine foot wide (9' W) vehicle overhead doors with cut sheet to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Roof shingles with metal ridge roll to be selected from the Approved Shingles List specifications.
- **Any/all garage finish details including but not limited to: Wood Siding; Service and Overhead Doors; Exterior Light Fixtures; Roof Shingles; Window(s); Final Site Plan, etc. to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**

MOTION: Faust/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

15-7-14c

Approve Application #15-7-8c, 1438 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications and/or revisions noted.

Install Wooden Privacy Fence

- Install new, six foot high (6' H), wooden privacy fence in rear yard with gates per revised site plan submitted and sample fence photo submitted.
- Final fence design to be submitted to staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the C. of A.

MOTION: Clark/Morgan (6-0-0) APPROVED

14. 15-7-14—CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

128 E. Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Ernst Wehausen & Maria-Francesca Fleming (Applicants/Owners)

Following the H. P. O. staff report, the presentation by the Owners/Applicants in attendance, and the review and discussion with the commissioners present, it was determined that the review would be conceptual with no formal action taken pending submittal of additional project details

Construct a New Two-Story Garage

- Construct a new, two-story, wood frame garage with heated/air conditioned second floor work space per submitted drawings.
- New building to be twenty-four feet wide by twenty-four feet long by twenty-five feet one inch high at roof peak (24'W x 24'L x 25' 1"H).
- Siding to be six inch (6") HardiePlank siding.
- Roof to be 3-tab fiberglass shingles to match house shingles—Tamko 'Antique Slate' 3-tab shingles.

Commissioner Comments:

- The overall size and setting appear to be appropriate for the site.
- Recommend looking for other existing two-story garage examples in historic districts for appropriate design cues (e.g. W. Second Avenue/Victorian Village)
- A measured site plan is needed for final review and approval including the location and a section drawing of the six foot high (6' H) wooden fence proposed.
- Two (2) overhead doors are recommended in lieu of one, single overhead door.
- Wood siding with wooden corner boards and wooden face trim at all doors and windows is necessary in lieu of artificial siding and trim materials.
- Vinyl windows are not appropriate.
- Recommend wood windows or aluminum-clad units as appropriate materials for the new carriage house/garage.
- A new application with construction drawings and all exterior finish details including, but not limited to, exterior paint colors, roof shingles, gutter and downspout specifications, etc. is required for final review and approval.

NO ACTION TAKEN

15. 15-7-15

240 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Bob & Tina Erlanger (Applicant/Owner)

Attn.: Joe Mazza, Construction Mgr.

Renovation and New Addition Plan

- Convert existing garage into a family room with second floor addition. Stucco finish to match.
- Construct an eight foot (8') addition across rear of the existing house allowing for expansion of the first floor dining room and kitchen, and second floor bedroom expansion, laundry room and master bath and closet.
- Construct new, 2-car, drive-through garage on the west, rear elevation with new slate roof per submitted plans.
- Construct a new screen porch on rear of house.
- Install a sixteen foot by thirty-two foot (16' x 32') swimming pool with flagstone pool deck in the rear yard per submitted plans.
- Expand the existing stone walls per submitted plans.
- All new addition finish details to match existing house finish details; like-for-like.

Following the H. P. O. staff report, the presentation by the project manager, Joe Mazza, the commissioners present commented on the proposed addition.

Commissioner Comments: General support voiced for a rear addition being constructed at this residence. Massing and finish details require additional refinements. Massing, driveway treatment, and porch column details are design issues that need further refinements.

Commissioner Clark—Voiced concern with the amount of parking proposed in the parking court and the proposed massing.

Commissioner Gibboney—Too much parking being shown. In support of the stone detailing.

Commissioner Morgan—Voiced concern with the size/width of the proposed driveway. Recommends making the drive narrower.

Commissioner Faust—Recommends detailing the new driveway with plantable, grass pavers. Recommends wrought iron gates.

Commissioner Wolf—Voiced concern with the east elevation as shown. Losing the existing triangular roof line on the original house detailing is an issue. Scale of the new addition and how it integrates into the original structure is important to consider. The west elevation roof slope is a concern.

(Note: 7:57 p.m.—Commissioner Gibboney was excused. Commissioner Rowan chaired the meeting.)

After the review and discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #15-7-15, 250 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Officer to place on the August 20th regular meeting agenda for further review.

MOTION: Morgan/Clark (5-0-1) [Gibboney]

STAFF APPROVALS

• 15-7-1

556 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Capital City Custom Home Improvement/Attn.: Scott Reed (A) Terry E. Hammond Trust (O)

Approve application 15-7-1, 556 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Sidewalk, Landing, & Step Repairs

- Remove any/all deteriorated and/or damaged concrete from front service walk and front service steps, as necessary.
- Remove any/all deteriorated and/or damaged concrete from rear landing, as necessary.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus Code.
- Install new concrete front service walk and front service steps of the exact same dimensions as the existing in the exact same location; like-for-like.
- Install new concrete on rear landing of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Tuck point the existing brick on rear landing. Joint profile and color to match the existing joint profile; like-for-like.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• 15-7-2

560 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Capital City Custom Home Improvement/Attn.: Scott Reed (A) Scotz Investments (O)

Approve application 15-7-2, 560 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove/Replace Handicap Ramp

- Remove any/all deteriorated and/or damaged concrete from existing concrete handicap ramp, as necessary.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus Code.
- Install new concrete ramp of exact same dimensions and profile; like-for-like.

Install Existing Handrail

- Re-install existing metal handrail upon completion of repairs.

Repair Basement Stairs

- Remove deteriorated/damaged existing top step on exterior basement stairway.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus Code.
- Install a new top concrete step of the same dimension and color in the exact same location; like-for-like.

• **15-7-3**

72 East Frambes Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Connie McGreevy (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-3, 72 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Roof Replacement

- Remove all asphalt shingles down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

☐ CertainTeed

Style:

Carriage House (dimensional)

Color:

☐ Stonegate Gray

☐ GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

☐ English Gray Slate

☐ Weathered Slate

☐ Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ Celotex

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Heritage Gray

☐ Slate Gray

☐ Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Estate Gray

☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."

• **15-7-4**

1138 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Daniel M. Sturkey (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-4, 1138 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Carriage House

Repair Roof

- Replace any/all deteriorated, damaged, and/or missing slate (approx. 250 sq. ft.) with new or used slate of same dimension, color, and profile; like-for-like.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing with brick which matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")

Repair Soffit

- Repair any/all deteriorated, damaged, and missing wooden eave/soffit (approx.. 265 sq. ft.) with new T & G wood of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all deteriorated, damaged, and missing wooden rafter tails (approx. 35 total) with new wooden rafter tails of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Repair and/or replace any/all deteriorated, damaged, and missing metal eave/soffit trim molding. All finish metal to match the historic profiles; like-for-like.
- Upon completion of all soffit/eave repairs, exterior trim paint colors to match existing; like-for-like

Remove Graffiti

- Remove all graffiti from all elevations using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x 2') section in the least visible location possible.
- Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area on the rear elevation that has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations.
- If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings," <http://www.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief01.htm>).

• **15-7-5**

142 East Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Midwest Construction Services (Applicant)

Kathy Signorino (Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-5, 142 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Roof Replacement

- Remove all asphalt shingles down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

☐ CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

☐ Stonegate Gray

☐ GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

☐ English Gray Slate

☐ Weathered Slate

☐ Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ Celotex

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Heritage Gray

☐ Slate Gray

☐ Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Estate Gray

☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."

- **15-7-6a**

671 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-6a, 671 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Repair Siding & Trim

- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood siding and trim with new wood of exact same dimension and profile as necessary; like-for-like.

Porch Repairs

- Make any/all repairs to the existing front porch (i.e. wooden floor, service step hand rails, ceiling, and cement columns as necessary.
- All new wood and/or cement column details to match existing original profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair Front Door

- Repair and refinish existing wooden front entry door. All repairs to match the original profiles and dimensions with same wood species; like-for-like.

Repair Gutters & Downspouts

- Following all eave repair/replacement, priming, and finish coating, re-install all existing metal gutters and metal down spouts in good condition in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Replace any/all deteriorated, damaged, and/or missing metal gutters and metal down spouts with new gutters and downspouts of appropriate style and dimension.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Paint Exterior

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. Any/all replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option to paint all siding and trim the same color(s) as existing or to submit new finish color schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to applying any finish coats.

- **15-7-7a**

667 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-7a, 671 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place. Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")

Porch Repairs

- Make any/all repairs to the existing front porch (i.e. wooden floor, service step hand rails, ceiling, and cement columns as necessary.
- All new wood and/or cement column details to match existing original profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair Front Door

- Repair and refinish existing wooden front entry door. All repairs to match the original profiles and dimensions

with same wood species; like-for-like.

Paint Exterior

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. **Any/all replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.**
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option to paint all siding and trim the same color(s) as existing or to submit new finish color schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to applying any finish coats.

Roof Replacement—Main House & Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

☐ CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

☐ Stonegate Gray

☐ GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

☐ English Gray Slate

☐ Weathered Slate

☐ Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

☐ Nickel Gray

☐ Celotex

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Heritage Gray

☐ Slate Gray

☐ Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Estate Gray

☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."

Repair Garage

- Repair existing wood-frame garage per all applicable Historic Resources Commission Guidelines and Columbus Building Codes.
- Any all new wood to match the original in style, dimension, and profile; like-for-like.
- If door replacement is deemed necessary, cut sheets/brochure(s) for new service and/or vehicle doors to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff prior to installation.

• **15-7-8a**

1438 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

M. Shane Hunt Member Integrity Trust Homes, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-8a, 1438 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Repair Porch Floor

- Make any/all repairs to the existing front porch wooden floor, as necessary.

- Any/all new flooring to match the style and dimensions of the existing T & G wood flooring; like-for-like.

Repair Wood Windows

- Examine all wood windows on all elevations.
- Repair all wood windows on all elevations in accordance with the H. R. C. guidelines and industry standards.
- Any/all new wood to match existing original wood in dimension, style, and profile; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Exterior Benjamin Moore paint schedule to be: Main Body Color = "Rodeo" (#1534); Windows and Main Trim = "River Gorge Gray" (#1537); Porch Floor & Steps = "Roosevelt Taupe" (#1539).

- 15-7-9a**

1516 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Classic Turnkey Properties, LLC (Applicant/Owner) (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-9a, 1516 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as indicated.

Rehab House Siding

- Remove all non-original, non-contributing shake siding and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing original wood lap siding with new wood lap siding of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Paint Exterior

- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces for painting using the appropriate hand tools. Repair/replace all missing, damaged, and deteriorated wood as necessary according to industry standards. Any/all replacement wood to be of same profile and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Owner has the option to paint all siding and trim the same color(s) as existing or to submit new finish color schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to applying any finish coats.

Install Ridge Roll on Main Roof

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "bronzetone" or "Tinner's Red" at owner's option.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Porch Repairs

- Make any/all repairs to the existing front porch (i.e. cement floor, service step hand rails, and T & G wood ceiling as necessary).
- Cap the existing, non-original 4" x 4" wood columns with wooden 1" x 6" wood boards to increase the dimensions appropriately.
- Install new wooden 2" x 2" balusters with wooden hand and foot rails or wooden privacy panels at owner's

option. Dimensioned drawing with section showing the style of porch rail system to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

- Install new black metal hand rail system at front porch service steps. Hand rail system cut sheet to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

- **15-7-10**

138 E. Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Mary Steele (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-10, 138 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Replace Window—(Rear)

- Remove deteriorated bathroom casement window and install new, Jeld-Wen Wood Casement Left (W-4500) 18.25" x 25.25" inch window unit per submitted cut sheets.
- Prime and paint to match the existing finish color.

- **15-7-11a**

53 East Northwood Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

David Neiderhiser (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-11a, 53 E. Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Replace Remaining Deteriorated Wood Windows Completely

- Due to severe deterioration to the seventeen (17) windows on all floors of all elevations, remove all sash and jambs completely and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Install complete (i.e. sash and jamb frame units), new, pre-primed, wood outside (unfinished wood inside) Jeld-Wen windows in all seventeen (17) window openings; like-for-like.

- **15-7-6b**

667 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-6b, 667 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Install New Rear Door

- Install new, wooden, door at rear entry per guidelines page #35, 'Appropriate Replacement Doors' provide by the Historic Preservation Officer.
New door to fit the original opening with transom to be repaired or replaced like-for-like as necessary.

- **15-7-7b**

671 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Blue Chip Development/Attn.: Derek Overcashier (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-6b, 671 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Install New Rear Door

- Install new, wooden, door at rear entry per guidelines page #35, 'Appropriate Replacement Doors' provide by the Historic Preservation Officer.
- New door to fit the original opening with transom to be repaired or replaced like-for-like as necessary.

- **15-7-13**

1646 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Vickie R. Ellison (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-7-13, 1646 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Install a Water Feature—Rear Yard

- Prepare the rear yard location for a ‘double pond’ water feature per submitted sketch.
- Install one thirty-six inch ([1] 36”) diameter pond and one thirty-eight inch ([1] 38”) diameter pond.
- Site locations to be prepared in accordance with manufacturer’s specifications for proper underlayment and liner installation.
- Install river rocks surrounding the pond with eighteen inch (18”) by twelve inch deep shelf around the perimeter.
- Pond to be located per the submitted photo.

• **15-7-16**

130 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

John M. Jahn (Applicant/Owner)

An application with current detailed photos has been submitted. The existing slate roof photos show severe deterioration and multiple repairs with non-matching used slate and roofing cement and confirm that the slate is beyond its useful life.

The bottom four (4) courses of shingles are asphalt with ogee gutter attached to the existing fascia wood and no roofing is being requested for this section at this time. The Applicant/Owner has consulted with the H.P.O. staff.
Approve Application #15-7-16, 130 E. Lane Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted with all clarifications as indicated.

Roof Replacement

- Due to severe deterioration of the existing ribbon slate, remove all slate shingles down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:
[] CertainTeed

Style:
Carriage House (dimensional)

Color:
[] Stonegate Gray

[] GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

[] English Gray Slate
[] Weathered Slate

[] Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] Celotex

(standard 3-tab)

[] Heritage Gray

[] Slate Gray

[] Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

[] Estate Gray

[] Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

[] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- **The bottom four (4) asphalt shingle courses of roof at eave/soffit line are not to be replaced at this time.**
- **Applicant/Owner is directed to submit a new application for repair/replacement of the bottom four shingle**

courses when replacement is necessary for analysis of the former box gutter system condition.

(Note: 8:05—Meeting recessed. 8:15—Meeting called back to order.)

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

H. P. Officer Black gave updates on Old Business items #1 and #2 and no actions were necessary at this time.

- **Item #1**
14-10-11—Rear Parking Status Report
205 E. Northwood Avenue
3D Group, Inc. (Applicant)
(Owner)
Northwood Park Historic District
Stocky III, LLC C/O Mark Ochsenbein Atty. at Law
H. P. O. awaiting final update. Staff directed to place on August 20th Meeting agenda under Old Business.
- **Item #2**
14-7-10b
685 Wilson Avenue
Tom Lang (Applicant/Owner)
Front Porch Rehab
New columns ‘test case’ one year (1 yr.) update.
H. P. O. awaiting final update. Staff directed to place on August 20th Meeting agenda under Old Business.
- **Item #3**
Design Standards for Rental Signage in Historic Districts/Rental Signage Approval
Accept stated Option #3 to be the established standard for signage posted on private residential properties in any and all historic districts or individually listed properties subject to exterior review and approval by the Historic Resources Commission as per City Code Chapters 3116 and 3117.
For Rent Sign Introduction Language Recommended:
 - In the residential areas of the historic districts, signage is to be incorporated without damaging or obscuring significant architectural features and details. Rental signage options have been developed in the interest of providing consistency of location and scale throughout the Columbus Register districts. Three (3) options have been approved for rental property signage. All residential rental signage requires review and approval by the Historic Resources Commission in accordance with City Code Chapters 3116 and 3117. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required prior to the installation of any/all signage.**Recommended Standard for H. R. C. Districts (previously noted as ‘Option #3’)**
 - One (1) sign only, to be placed on the ground floor, front elevation of the residence in a location that does not damage or conceal significant architectural features or details. Sign to be no larger than eighteen inches wide by twelve inches high (max. = 18”W x 12”H). Text to be limited to phone number and contact/company name. Exact location, size, text, and materials to be submitted to the H. R. C. for review and approval prior to installation

Staff report given and speaker slips forwarded to the acting Chair. Chairman Rowan called the speakers in the order received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Roger Deal 97 E. Oakland Avenue Northwood Park Resident & Home Owner	City Code prohibits signage in residential areas of a commercial nature. There have been some signs in the past but signage is increasing. What is proposed with Option 3 is a “good, reasonable” compromise between commercial signage and yet allows contact information. The sign information proposed is not commercial. ‘For Rent’ signs are commercial. In favor of the signage proposal as indicated. Commercial signage is prohibited in residential districts by City Code.
Maria-Francesca Fleming 128 E. Oakland Avenue Northwood Park Resident & Home Owner	Spoke to the commission a year and a half ago and since then the number of signs have increased in the neighborhood. The proliferation of signs “. . . ruins the ambiance of the historic neighborhood”. The more signs installed, the more difficult it will be to regulate. Recommends adoption as enforcement is complicated with the passage of time without action.

Chairman Gibboney rejoined the meeting.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Ernest L. Wehausen 128 E. Oakland Avenue Northwood Park Resident & Home Owner	This is my third of fourth time talking about this. This is advertising in an historic district--all signage is advertising. I don’t think it’s appropriate. Have no problem with the signage proposed, even “For Rent” for a limited time. Traditionally there have been for rent signs. The widow who had a roomer put out a ‘For Rent’ sign. The proposed size is appropriate. But two requirements need to be in place—the commission needs to approve any/all signage and there needs to be a time limit. Control the size and location and put a time limit on all rental signs. Recommend two to three month time limits on rental signage. Front yard signs don’t work. Most real estate people take care of properties.
Susan Martin 135 Waters Mill Circle Eventide Rentals	Representing Eventide and specifically the Northwood Historic District properties particularly the east side of North High Street properties and is the Eventide attorney. We are very prideful of our properties. Has communicated for years with the H. P. Office regarding the Eventide properties. Has concerns with the code authority of the commission to regulate signage. Requests the proof of the authority of the H. R. C. to control signage in the districts in City Code. “In Eventide’s case, these are not ‘For Rent’ signs, these are branding signs. They don’t say for rent, I think that is cheesy. These things are always for rent. Everything around campus is for rent all the time. . . We have these signs on our buildings because we are prideful of our buildings—we like the way they look. We think they’re in good taste.” The ground level signage proposal is a bad proposal. Ground level signage is not visible from the street and raises tenant safety concerns. Questioned the H. R. C. authority to regulate commercially zoned property signage. Urges the commission not to act tonight and is available to work with the commission on this issue.

Charles Martin 24 Spring Creek Drive Eventide Rentals	Has attended several meetings previously. Noted that signage has many reasons that are important to consider such as branding and safety. Recommends more public input prior to the imposition of signage standards. Size and mounting requirements are important considerations for signage regulations. There are no owner occupied properties in the Eventide portfolio.
---	---

Following the public speaker comments, the commissioners present made observations regarding the signage standards issue.

Commissioner Morgan—It is important to enforce any signage standard that we enact and feel at a loss as to why that has not been done to date. Could vote on the proposal as indicated.

Commissioner Clark—Has been concerned about the process for some time. Favors notification of all property owners in the university districts and all property owners in the districts regulated by this commission. More concerned about the process following Ms. Martin's testimony this evening. Not prepared to vote in approval tonight or if ever. Notice needs to be more thorough.

Commissioner Rowan—I think we are getting very close to deciding on a signage standard.

Commissioner Wolf—Not prepared to act at this time.

Following the public comment and subsequent discussion a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Direct the Historic Preservation Officer to place the Design Standards for Rental Signage in Historic Districts on the August 20, 2015 meeting agenda for further consideration.

MOTION: Rowan/Clark (5-0-0) CONTINUED

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURN

MOTION: Morgan/Rowan (5-0-0) ADJOURNED 9:04 p.m.

